Mark MELI

Beer or ale drinking is doubtlessly one of the central elements of British gustatory and social life.¹⁾ More than a thousand years before any Briton ever heard of tea, Roman legions reported on the people of the British Isles' love for the fermented infusions of malted barley. Located between 49° N and 59° N latitude, Great Britain experiences long summer days, which are perfect for growing barley in abundance. Once hulled, this grain could be eaten in soups and gruels, or ground into flour and used in bread, but bread made from barley was universally seen as inferior to that made from wheat, so barley was often malted to be used in brewing. The brewing process had the added benefit of sterilizing the water used in beer, which made beer not only a nutritious food, but a drink that was, in some places, safer than water.²⁾

As Wolfgang Schivelbusch notes, in pre-modern Britain, as in much of northern Europe, beer was consumed as a staple food, and not just as a refreshing beverage or drug as it mostly is today. Britons in the 17th century consumed an average of three liters of beer per person per day, and that figure includes women and children, who also drank copiously. A typical breakfast might have been beer soup, with beer poured over stale bread and heated, with the possible addition of milk or an egg (Schivelbusch 1992, 22–3). The fact that beer was considered a healthy food is represented in William Hogarth's 1751 prints, *Beer Street* and *Gin Lane*, wherein beer drinking citizens are portrayed as happy, healthy, and prosperous whereas those drinking gin—a cheap, distilled beverage containing 40% abv (alcohol by volume) or more, are depicted as drunk, insane, debilitated, and criminal (see Schivelbusch 1992, 147-66).

Although we speak of a *traditional* beer culture, we must keep in mind that the forms of drinking and the material content of the beverage have been constantly evolving throughout history. Changes have come as a result of technological innovation, such as the development of coke-fueled indirect malt kilns and pure-strain yeasts, as well as bottle and cans. They have come as a result of socio-economic changes such as the capitalist and industrial revolutions, which took people off farms and put them into factories and offices and thereby changed their relationship to alcohol. They came as a result of national political events, particularly wars, wherein taxes on malt were almost always raised, resulting in thinner, weaker beers being brewed.

Furthermore, and this shall be a focus of the present essay, changes in beer styles and ways of drinking have come as a result of interaction and exchange with the larger world. This of course begins with the pre-historical importation of barley agriculture into the British Isles, before which the fermentation of honey into mead may have occurred, but the brewing of beer would have been unknown. The first well-documented shakeup of British brewing due to foreign influence may have been the introduction of the use of hops in beer, by Dutch immigrant brewers in the 15th century. This move was, at first, stridently opposed by the traditional brewers of un-hopped ales. By the early 17th century, however, hops had clearly won over the drinking populace (Cornell 2003, 64).

This essay shall focus on two more recent events wherein overseas influence has shaken up British beer culture. While these two events are very different—almost diametrically opposed—in their economic roots and in the

cultural meanings they have been given, they both came as the result of the late 20th century trend towards a globalized marketplace and culture. And while both events encompass economic and cultural effects, it could be said that the first was primarily driven by economic concerns and the second by cultural ones. The first event was the introduction of large-scale keg ale and lager brewing in the 1960s and its massive growth over the next 20 to 30 years. Foreign-owned brewers of international pilsners managed to make disruptive inroads into the British brewing industry, which led to a frenzy of rationalization and consolidation, with British brewers moving to produce filtered, pasteurized, and artificially carbonated keg beers. In the eyes of ale traditionalists, this beer, whether ale or lager, became a threat to the beer culture of Britain. This led to the formation of The Campaign for Real Ale (CAMRA), a consumer advocacy group that has fought to protect traditional beer.

More recently, since roughly 2010, we have seen the growth of American-style craft beer throughout Britain. While very much influenced by the British brewing tradition itself, craft beer as it developed in the US took a radically different approach to ale brewing than that of the Isles, resulting in beers that are generally stronger, hoppier, and use a wider variety of yeasts and more additives than traditional ales. These beers, and the much greater variety that they represent, have appealed to a wide range of Britons, beginning with younger drinkers, and the question now arises if these too constitute a threat to British brewing culture.

In order to answer this question, we shall first define what it is that today constitutes *traditional* British beer. We will then move on to briefly discuss the threat that industrial keg ale and lager presented to this tradition, and the success that CAMRA had in preserving the tradition. Next we shall consider the threat to traditional British beer that may or may not be posed by *craft beer*, by focusing on the reaction to craft beer by CAMRA, and the ripples that this booming brewing sector is sending through the contemporary beer culture of Britain. We shall conclude by asking what the future may hold for traditional British beer.

1. Defining "Traditional British Beer"

First, we need to describe what we mean by "traditional" British beer. This can be explained through two different aspects: traditional beer styles, and traditional serving methods.

Beer style is, according to Garrett Oliver, "the codification of all parameters that group particular beers together." He continues: "A beer's style will encompass its color, its level of carbonation, aroma, aspects of its flavor, the brewing technique used to make it, and the often-rich history from which it derives" (Oliver 2012, 114–5). The foremost style consideration here is that traditional British beer is ale rather than lager. That is to say that it is fermented quickly (2–7 days) at relatively high temperatures (15° C -24 $^{\circ}$ C) with the top-fermenting yeast *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*, as opposed to the bottom-fermenting lager yeast *S. pastorianus*, which "ferments more slowly (5–10 days) and at lower temperatures, (7 $^{\circ}$ C -13 $^{\circ}$ C) (Jones, 2012, 27). This sets traditional British beer apart from the main mass of industrially-brewed beer all over the world, the majority of which is international pilsner, a lager, based upon the style developed in the city of Plzen in Bohemia in 1842. In comparison to lagers, ales tend to have a more distinctive fruity character, and this can be found in all traditional British styles.

The Brewer's Art, a book published by the London Brewery Whitbread in 1948, "asserted that 'In this country there are four chief types of

beer: pale ale, mild ale, stout, and Burton,'" (Cornell 2003, 202). Burton ale is something that barely exists today, a strong, pale, aged beer that is exemplified in some remaining brews but no longer recognized as a distinct style (Cornell 2010). That leaves us pale ale, mild ale, and stout as the three main traditional styles of British beer. Since the early to mid–19th century, 'pale ale' has been roughly synonymous with 'bitter,' the latter generally used by consumers and publicans to refer to draught beer and the former used inside breweries and in reference to bottled beer (Cornell 2010, pp. 10–1). Cornell relates: "Today the general definition of bitter is that it is pale, drier than a brewer's other products and the most highly hopped. Even now, strengths can vary considerably" from less than 3% abv to around 6%, and "color can also show considerable variation" from golden to carnelian (Cornell 2010, 18. See also Meli 2012).

Mild, the most popular beer in the UK at the time, started out meaning simply a young beer as opposed to an aged, typically sour one. By 1948, however, milds were usually deep amber to black in color, sweet as opposed to dry, and much less heavily hopped than pale ales. Stout, the black beer made with roasted malt or roasted raw barley and best typified by the Irish beer Guinness, had first evolved as "stout porter," meaning a strong porter, the dark style of beer that, in many different variations, was the most popular beer in the UK for over a century but had gradually given way to mild and pale ales in popularity. Nevertheless, enough stout was still produced post–war for it to be included in this list.

We must note here that the styles that were deemed to be "chief" by Whitbread in 1948, and which we shall term the most traditional today, have been subject to no small degree of historical flux. As previously mentioned, before the early 15th century, no hops were used in British brewing, with various herbs and spices sometimes added instead. This would have made for a

beverage that few people today would recognize as beer. Furthermore, the porter that was Britons' favorite beer for the period roughly between 1700–1850 also evolved during that time, and would have been very different from beers called porter or stout today. It would have used brown malts instead of black malt or roasted barley, making it lighter in color, less roasted in flavor and aroma, and richer in malt flavors. It was also likely to contain a substantial portion of aged beer, which, having rested in wooden barrels for months or even years, would have become quite sour as a result of bacteria in the wood completing a secondary fermentation.

Mild itself as a style has evolved much in the last 150 years. As Cornell notes, "For Victorian brewers, and those who came before them, any beer, strong or weak, hoppy or not, dark or light, could be called mild if it was young enough" (Cornell 2010, 23). For most of its history, "mild" was thus a synonym for "young." It was only in the second half of the 20th century that mild came to mean a dark, low alcohol, and lightly hopped beer. This was, as mentioned, the most popular beer from the end of WW II until the mid 1960s, when that distinction was taken over by bitter, or pale ale. Although mild made up nearly 70% of draught beer sales right after the war, sales dropped to 5.7 million barrels in 1972 and have continued to plummet, down to only 800,000 barrels in 1998 (Cornell 2010, 39–41). So although several hundred breweries in the UK, and many elsewhere as well, brew a mild ale each year, its demise has led Cornell to label it "endangered" (Cornell 2012).

The second characteristic of traditional British beer, and its most unique aspect, is its preferred method of serving: as cask ale, meaning that the beer has undergone conditioning in the cask. According to Pepper: "Cask conditioning is the process in which a draught beer retains yeast to enable a secondary fermentation to take place in a cask in the pub cellar" (Pepper 2012,

228). This implies that such beer is unpasteurized and also unfiltered, as pasteurization would kill the yeast and filtration remove it. When a cask ale is tapped, no carbon dioxide is used to push the beer out. Instead, air is let in, and the beer is either let to flow out by gravity, or more often, pulled out with a pump. "The most common way to serve cask conditioned beer is by the use of a beer engine, a hand-operated hydraulic pump, that draws beer from a cask in the cellar up to the bar. It is commonly called a hand-pull or hand-pump" (Pepper 2012, 228–9). These are the distinctive tap handles found in traditional British pubs (see Photo 1).



Photo 1: Surrey Hills Brewery's Shere Drop, the 2019 Champion Beer of Britain, poured from the cask by beer engine at the GBBF.

Cask conditioning results in several unique characteristics in a beer. For one, after the cask is tapped, the beer will evolve rather quickly, due to the presence of oxygen in the cask. Flavors may improve for 1–2 days but will make a sharp decline afterwards, meaning that the beer must be consumed quickly, usually within 3–5 days. Since no carbon dioxide is added, but fermentation is continuing in the cask, the beer will be only lightly carbonated compared to typically force–carbonated lagers. Cask ale should have a light but noticeable carbonation: "Contrary to much foreign opinion, cask conditioned beer should never be flat. A certain amount of carbon dioxide must be retained in the beer to give it liveliness on the palate," which will vary depending on where in the UK the beer is served (Pepper 2012, 228).

Although gravity served beer, in which no beer engine is used, is the main method used in many UK festivals, it is rather inconvenient in a pub and thus rarely seen. We should keep in mind, however, that the beer engine has not always existed: "A version of the beer engine was patented by the prolific British innovator, locksmith, and hydraulic engineer Joseph Bramah in 1797. The modern beer engine has changed little since the early 1800s" (Hunt 2012, 109). Before that time, all cask ale would have been served by gravity.

It should also be mentioned that cask ale is stored in unrefrigerated cellars, to enable secondary fermentation to take place. It is thus served at cellar temperature, usually $13^{\circ}C-14^{\circ}C$, which, while still *chilled*, is quite a bit warmer than that of kegged lager, which is usually served at $7^{\circ}C-10^{\circ}C$ for a traditional German pilsner, or colder than $5^{\circ}C$ for generic international lagers. It should also be noted that while "(c) ask conditioned beer is the traditional drink of the British pub" (Pepper 2012, 228), bottled beer also became popular throughout the 20^{th} century. In the case that traditional ale is bottled, this is also done without pasteurization or filtration, and without the adding of

artificial carbon dioxide, to create what is termed bottle-conditioned beer.

2. The Growth of Keg Ale and Lager and the Response of CAMRA

This chapter briefly relates the tale of the corporate assault on traditional British beer that gathered steam in the 1960s and 70s and which led to the formation and ultimate success of CAMRA. This organization that led a drive to support cask ale that has been so fruitful that it has been called one of the most successful consumer organizations in the world (Hampson 2013, 11), and the one having the most influence over the beer brewed in any country (Philliskirk 2012, 210).

The changes in the British brewing world that took place in the 1960s and 70s and led to a decline of cask ale are many, and have been described in detail by others, particularly Cornell (2003), and Haydon (2001), so we will merely outline them here. In general, it can be said that cask ale was gradually being replaced in pubs by keg beer—that is, pasteurized ale or lager that was force-carbonated and served cold. In takeaway form, bottle-conditioned ale was similarly losing out to pasteurized and force-carbonated ales and lagers in bottle and can. There are many reasons behind this move, but we should keep in mind that foremost is the relative difficulty in transporting, handling, and serving cask ale. It is a living product that is open to the air, and so must be handled correctly and served quickly after tapping. This makes it expensive for producers to ship—it has to be kept chilled—and for pubs to serve—they have to keep trained cellar men who know how to care for the beer. This also meant much wasted beer when it could not be sold quickly enough and went off. For customers, it could mean unreliable quality, with people sometimes sold old or poorly kept ale.

It was the consolidation and rationalization of the brewing industry,

spurred on by foreign competition and investment, that made the expense and bother of providing cask ale a major issue, however. Entry into the market of Canadian E. P. Taylor and his Carling Lager, and his subsequent acquisition of stakes in "over twenty British breweries" and takeover of ten by 1960 led to a panic throughout the industry (Cornell 2003, 209). In order to compete, and overcome a situation where brewers could not get their beers sold in pubs that were increasingly tied to rivals, other British breweries soon followed suit, so that "almost 200 breweries were taken over in the fifteen years between 1955 and 1969," leading to a "big six" of brewing conglomerates that controlled 56% of all pubs and brewed 82% of all UK beers by 1972 (Cornell 2003, 216-7). Larger, national brewing companies preferred to ship keg beer: since it was pasteurized, it could survive rougher handling than cask ale. This led these large companies to pour great sums of money into marketing keg beer, mostly through the new medium of television, making it more appealing to a younger generation of drinkers.

Along with this, the Licensing Act of 1961 enabled a wider variety of businesses to sell bottled or canned beer for off-premise consumption, which increased sales of these formats. This further helped lager, which suffered little from canning, and spurred a great increase in its consumption: "In 1950 lager accounted for 2 per cent of all beer sales: by 1990 it accounted for 50 per cent." (Haydon 2001, 288–9). Martyn Cornell notes that a shift in consumer preference towards lager was occurring at the same time:

> This new, light (in several senses), 'modern' beer had arrived at a time when the motivation for beer-drinking was changing, and its success was helped by everything from the decline in heavy manual work, which lessened the demand for a filling, energy-giving drink, to

the rise in central heating, which meant a cold drink was more welcome than even a cellar-cool one. The semi-conscious reason for drinking beer had moved from 'restoration' to 'refreshment.' Lager, served cold, with more carbon dioxide 'bite', was more 'refreshing', and for lager drinkers strength (or flavour) was irrelevant to the appeal. (Cornell 2003, 213)

All of these factors led to a situation wherein "cask conditioned beer was then on the wane, phased out by British brewers who deemed it archaic, expensive, and difficult to maintain and serve. Filtered, force-carbonated keg beers were offered in its place" (Philliskirk 2012, 208). Keg beer had accounted for only 1% of sales in 1959, but this grew to 40% in 1976 (Haydon 2001, 288).

While, as shall be explained later, there is no real reason that keg beer need be low in quality, nearly all comments from experienced cask ale drinkers concerning the matter claim that it was. It is clear that pasteurization dulls aromas and flavors somewhat. It is also clear that serving beer at lower temperatures has a similar effect. The debate continues over whether or not naturally carbonated beer is superior to force carbonated beer in every circumstance—but the high levels of carbonation achieved in the latter was certainly unattractive to someone accustomed to cask ale. It is also clear that along with this shift from cask to keg, the consolidation and increased competition in the market increased pressure on breweries to reduce costs, and this may have been as much of the reason behind the supposed drop in quality in keg beer as the container itself was. The abv of keg beer was lowered, since the higher carbonation and lower temperature made it nearly impossible to tell the difference (Boak and Baily 2014, 93). Lower grade materials were also used, with various grain adjuncts being substituted for malted barley, leading to thinner, less flavorful brews (Boak and Baily 2014, 95).

As Cornell noted, new beer drinkers simply seeking refreshment may not have been bothered by these changes. But for those already accustomed to the pleasures of a good pint, they became intolerable. Four such drinkers were Michael Hardman, Graham Less, Jim Makin, and Bill Mellor, who decided in 1971 to form the Campaign for the Revitalization of Ale, (later changed to the Campaign for Real Ale), "in response to the perceived poor quality and blandness of British beer at the time" (Philliskirk 2012, 208). Stated goals of the movement included preserving the pub as a center of community life. protecting consumers' interests vis a vis beer producers, and supporting traditional cider and perry production, but their main goal has always been to promote cask ale, which CAMRA dubbed "real ale," meaning the true, living beer of British tradition (See Dorber 2012). The first point of their mission statement still reads: "Our mission is to secure the long term future of real ale. real cider, and real perry by increasing their quality, availability, and popularity" (CAMRA 2020). It is worth quoting CAMRA's passage "What is Real Ale?" at length:

> In the early 1970s, CAMRA coined the term 'real ale' to describe traditional draught cask beers, distinguishing them from the processed and highly carbonated beers that were promoted by big brewers at that time.

> Real ale is a 'living' product, which is typically produced and stored in a cask container. In comparison to other types of beer that kill off the yeast and artificially inject the beer with CO_2 prior to serving, real ale contains live yeast which continues to condition and

ferments the beer until it is served.

Like any artisan product, real ale requires special handling and storing to ensure the quality of taste. Well-kept real ale served at the right temperature should be lively, naturally carbonated and flavourful – representing the pinnacle of brewing art. (CAMRA 2020)

CAMRA advanced their agenda in various ways. Since 1972 they have printed the newspaper *What's Brewing*, focused on real ale and pub culture. Since 1974 they have published a yearly *Good Beer Guide*, a book listing up the pubs in the UK that serve real ale in fine condition, and rewarding the best with special mentions. In 1975 they held the first national beer festival, and since 1977 have held the Great British Beer Festival (GBBF), which has become an annual institution. CAMRA also sponsors dozens of local and regional beer festivals throughout the year. They have fought not only to preserve historical pubs, but to break the control that large breweries often had over their "tied" pubs, which enabled brewers to force pubs to carry only their own products. At present, CAMRA has over 190,000 members.³⁾

The general opinion of beer writers and historians in the UK is that CAMRA overwhelmingly succeeded in saving cask ale from its feared demise. Pete Brown states: "CAMRA's formative years were a single-minded pursuit to save traditional British beer. Even the organisation's harshest critics concede that CAMRA's intervention saved cask ale from extinction" (Brown 2016). Hugh Thomas stated in 2016 that since "more than 11,000 real ales are now brewed in the UK," CAMRA had "effectively achieved its goal" (Thomas 2016). It is generally agreed that cask ale is no longer in danger of disappearing, although it is also often mentioned in the same breath that things could be better. *The Cask Report*, a CAMRA-sponsored survey into the

availability, quality and popularity of cask beer, showed that in 2018 sales of cask ale had declined by 6.8% compared to the previous year (Hampson 2018, 1; Eley 2019).

Several reasons have been given for this decline, including problems with quality, serving temperatures that are too high, and lack of interest from a younger generation that sees cask ale as "uncool" (Eley 2018, 12), not to mention the drop in overall beer consumption in the UK, as the market has shrunk by about 25% in this century (Brown 2015). One other reason that is often given for falling interest in cask ale is its new competition, which has been building over the past decade or so: craft beer. This is quality-centered, small-volume beer that may be served from cask but more often comes in kegs. It has shattered the notion that only cask beer can be of high quality, and has led to much confusion in the British beer industry, as well as to a great amount of innovation and growth.

3. Craft Beer and How it Differs from Traditional Beer

Generally speaking, craft beer is a movement towards smaller breweries making a wider variety of beers with a focus on the quality of the beverage as opposed to what came to be seen the major industrial breweries' focus on marketing and inoffensive flavors, and their growing use of cheaper, non-traditional adjuncts. The movement began in the 1980s in the United States, although it was not generalized using the term 'craft beer' until much later. In 1980s America, it was difficult to find a domestically-made beer that was not a version of the international pilsner, with little variation between any of them. Influenced by the legalization of home brewing in 1978 and the experiences of American military and travelers in Europe who wished to drink beers as flavorful as those they encountered there, small "micro breweries"

began popping up all over the country, challenging the commercially-driven breweries' versions of "fizzy yellow liquid" that preserved little of the taste of traditional beers. One recognizes in these changes a spirit similar to that exhibited by CAMRA in the UK, in its attack on keg beer. (For histories of craft beer in the US, see Acitelli (2013) and Hindy (2014).)

What is important to note here, is that in distinction to the situation in the UK from the 1970s to today, in the US of the 1980s, there was no indigenous traditional brewing culture left to speak of. With only a handful of local exceptions, nearly all American beer at that time was international lager, a generic version of the original pilsner—and little different from the international lagers that were seen by CAMRA as a threat to cask ale.

It should also be noted that, although there were Belgian, German, Czech, and pre-prohibition American influences upon the new wave of craft beers, the British influence predominated from the start. From Anchor Porter to Sierra Nevada Pale Ale or Bert Grant's Scottish Style Ale, the majority of craft beer was inspired by the traditional styles of the British Isles.

In the US, as large brewing corporations started to label some of their beer "craft" and to buy out successful craft breweries, the Brewers Association came to devise a strict definition of what they considered a craft brewer. The definition has been modified over the years to allow for growth and for the popularity of new ingredients, but it is still in use today:

> An American craft brewer is a small and independent brewer. Small: Annual production of 6 million barrels of beer or less... Independent: Less than 25 percent of the craft brewery is owned or controlled... by a beverage alcohol industry member that is not itself a craft brewer.

關西大學『文學論集』第70巻第3号

Brewer: Has a TTB (Tax and Trade Bureau) Brewer's Notice and makes beer. (Brewers Association 2020)

In the US, then, the distinction was simple: it was large, industrial, corporate "big beer" versus small, hand-crafted, traditional "craft beer." But in places like the UK, where traditional, local breweries still existed alongside "big beer," the entrance into the scene of American-influenced "craft beer" had an entirely different meaning and created entirely different problems and possibilities.

"Craft" Beer in the UK

Small breweries continued to open in Britain in the 1990s, and the pace grew in the new century. While the focus of these breweries tended to be upon traditional cask ale, they also showed other influences, with some new brewers making German or Czech-style lagers, and some venturing into Belgian-style beers. Little by little, however, the American attitude towards craft brewing came to have the biggest influence. To give one example, Thornbridge Brewery, opened in 2005, scored a big hit in Britain and abroad with its Jaipur India Pale Ale (IPA). IPA was a 19th century style of British beer that became popular with Britons living in India. It was stronger and more heavily hopped than other pale ales, and thus could survive the long sea journey in excellent condition. This style had all but died out in the UK, when it was revived in the US, making use of new, American hop varietals. Despite being named "Jaipur" in an attempt to bring back images of colonial India, Thornbridge describes its flagship beer as an "American-style IPA." Thus to brew a craft IPA in Britain in 2005 was to brew an American-style beer.

The distinction between traditional beer and British craft beer was

perhaps brought to the forefront by the 2007 arrival and sudden popularity of, and publicity surrounding, Scottish brewer BrewDog. Claiming to be the first innovative craft brewery in Britain, they stated that they "were bored of the industrially brewed lagers and stuffy ales that dominated the UK beer market," and so decided to brew themselves (BrewDog 2020).

The number of breweries in the UK expanded at a rapid pace until 2018, from "the country's 500 small and medium-sized breweries" cited by Cornell (2003, p. 234), to some 2,274 (Hacker Young 2020). Some of these breweries made cask ale, often alongside keg beer. Many others made only keg beer. This brought up many questions in the UK beer world: was kegged craft beer "real ale?" Would it be accepted and supported by CAMRA? Should traditional British beer be considered "craft beer?" In the absence of an over-arching definition like that of the American Brewers Association, these questions were difficult to answer.

Tension about the relationship of cask ale to the new American-style craft beer seemed to bubble over in the days preceding the 2011 GBBF. BrewDog had signed onto the festival, and was going to be permitted to serve its beers from kegs, as long as it followed certain carefully-prescribed stipulations concerning pasteurization, filtration, and the addition of gas. With the festival scheduled to begin August 2, on July 14 CAMRA cancelled BrewDog's contract, citing the brewery's lack of payment of fees and failure to provide its beer in sufficiently large kegs (Perrett 2011). BrewDog immediately claimed that CAMRA had reneged on their contract because they were uncomfortable with BrewDog's beers being served from kegs (BrewDog 2011). The spat quickly escalated, with both sides attacking the other, and many of CAMRA's top executives rejecting the notion that keg beer could be real ale. In the end, it seemed that the fight added to CAMRA's reputation

among young drinkers as a stodgy, old man's organization that was simply too entrenched in its ways to do anything new. The publicity certainly did no harm to BrewDog, which was on its way to becoming a company worth more than \$2 billion in 2020.

It was not until 2019 that CAMRA allowed keg beer in the Great British Beer Festival (Hook 2019). This was thought by many to be done in order to "modernize its image and consequently make itself more relevant to modern beer drinkers" (Ryebeck 2019). CAMRA at last had found a way of dealing with keg beer that satisfied almost everyone: it had to be unpasteurized and unfiltered, and served from a *key keg*. This type of keg contains a plastic bag inside a plastic shell. In order to push the beer out, gas is inserted inside the shell, which puts pressure on the bag inside (see photo 2).



Photo 2

Photo 3

Photos 2–3: A decorative display of key kegs (I), plus cask and keg ales from craft brewer Tiny Rebel, side by side (r) at the 2019 GBBF.

Thus no CO_2 comes into contact with the beer itself, making it qualify as "real ale" in CAMRA's new understanding (Ryebeck 2019).

Defining "Craft Beer" in Britain

Despite this softening of CAMRA's stance, problems persist in defining just what is and what is not craft beer. Beer journalist Pete Brown has succinctly summed up this difficulty:

Craft in the US is a straightforward proposition. There, the Brewers' Association defines a craft brewer <u>as one that is small, independent</u> <u>and traditional</u>, and keeps a tight grip on who gets to be included. But in the UK, there is no comparable definition. Craft accounts for 2%, 10% or maybe 20% of the market, depending on who you ask, and how they define it...When craft beer emerged in the US, it stood against a market dominated by three identical-tasting commercial lagers. It clearly stood for quality and flavour. But here in the UK, there was already a product that tasted very different from American craft beer, but ticked all the boxes of being traditional, small scale and independent: real ale. So is craft beer the same thing as real ale? This is where the headaches begin, before you've even touched a drop. (Brown 2015)

When it comes to the question of defining craft beer in the UK, there are three main opinions, which we shall call 1. The *Inclusivist* position: *Small and Independent = Craft*, 2. The *Exclusivist* position: *Craft = New Wave/American-style*, and 3. The *Traditionalist* position: *Kegged Beer Might = Craft but Real Ale is Always Best.*

In general, when writing explicitly of the matter most people take the Inclusivist position, but this seems mostly in order to avoid controversy. The Exclusivist position is in fact held by many supporters of new wave craft beer, particularly its younger-generation consumers, and may be exemplified in BrewDog's claim that cask ale is "stuffy." The Traditionalist position is held by much of CAMRA's old guard, who may have come to admit the quality of much kegged craft beer, but still wish to draw a distinction between that and real ale. In this stance, the Traditionalist position shares much with the Exclusivist one, while at the same time appearing to place itself in the Inclusivist camp. It states that "craft" should apply to all small and independent breweries, but attempts to preserve the distinctive position of cask ale.

Below we shall review statements arguing each of the three positions. In doing so, we shall ignore the question of whether or not industrially-made beer can be considered craft beer.

The Inclusivist position

For the most part, those arguing this position clearly accept that American-style craft is indeed "craft," but also wish to claim that cask ale brewed by independent breweries is itself craft beer. When asked his opinion by Pete Brown, Bob Pease, then CEO of the Brewers Association in the USA, stated this position clearly: "American craft brewers were inspired by British tradition and flavour. We just put our own spin on it. It's great that American-style beers are doing so well here (the UK), but real ale is obviously craft beer" (Brown 2015). Tom Steiner, upon taking the position of CAMRA Chief Executive, made a similar claim: "(The statistics) say craft beer is booming—but what is craft? Real ale is craft beer!" (Protz 2019).

While most people taking this position focus upon keeping cask ale

included, others are obviously aiming their criticism at CAMRA for excluding new wave craft beer from its field of interest:

'Real Ale' as an expression was adopted by...CAMRA in 1973...The appellation is a convenient campaigning device that has attracted a number of crass comments about the "realness" of filtered beers. Certainly an excellent India pale ale, even if filtered, is considered by most beer enthusiasts very real indeed. (Dorber 2012, 688)

Similarly, "(s)ome argue that CAMRA may have saved "real ale," but has stunted the further development of British beer by casting aspersion upon quality beers and excellent pubs that lie outside its tight designations" (Philliskirk 2012, 209).

The Inclusivist position is also represented in the work of SIBA, the Society of Independent Brewers, which attempted to put forth a definition similar to that of the American Brewers Association in its "Assured Independent British Craft Brewer Campaign" (SIBA). This campaign tried to limit who could be termed "craft brewers" to its own members, who are "independent" and "brew quality beer." While this campaign, started in 2017, has had little to no influence across the wider British beer world, SIBA's activities still generally attempt to bring craft and cask brewers together.

The Exclusivist Position

Few people in the industry explicitly take this hardline position, either out of the desire not to alienate too many people, or simply because most brewers of American-style craft beer also appreciate good cask ale. This is more the position of the consumer, more likely to be heard in pubs or beer festivals than seen in print, though it often appears implicitly. An example is a web-based article on "14 Best London Craft Breweries," which has no explicit words to add to the discussion, yet stresses that "in recent years beer has undergone a total transformation," and lists only breweries making Americanstyle craft beer, with no mention of cask ales whatsoever (Stagweb 2019).

Freelance beer journalist Tony Naylor, often writing in the *Guardian*, is far more explicit and aggressive. He uses "craft" to denote beers "with attitude," that "taste amazing," and are "liberate(d) ... from stifling conventions." "Craft is an attitude," he says, "not a rule book" (Naylor 2017). He then goes on to write condescendingly of traditional cask ale brewers in a manner that exemplifies the Exclusivist position: "Whatever...your opinion of Adnam's and Moorhouse's beer, it is impossible to make a serious case that either demonstrates bold innovation, in terms of ingredients, packaging, promoting new beers styles or punchy flavours, that has characterized the best UK craft brewers" (Naylor 2017). His point is taken: traditional, by definition, cannot be craft. Craft must be new, bold and innovative. Here he mimics BrewDog's position—their whole point is that they are bold and innovative.⁴⁾

Naylor also makes a vague distinction based on the use of hops as a factor "in differentiating craft brewers (which, generally, use a lot more US hops), from traditional UK real ale brewers (which, broadly, use less hops, but those they do use tend to be English)" (Naylor 2017). While "generally" and "broadly" we might agree with this claims, they reveal so many exceptions as to be practically useless—many craft beers today are sour, and use no hops at all. Naylor's opinion is more about attitude, style, and youthful newness than it is about beer.

The Traditionalist Position

This position is demonstrated by Protz and Tierney–Jones, who clearly state that they believe traditional British cask ale deserves to be considered "craft," yet also claim that cask ale has and should maintain a special place in the British beer scene. For instance, on the inclusive end:

> It would be a mistake to assume that all craft brewers are newcomers to the trade. Far from it: there are many family brewers with long pedigrees that are as passionate about beer and modern brewing practice as their younger rivals. As Stuart Bateman of Batemans brewery in Wainfleet, Lincolnshire, says: 'Don't tell me I'm not a craft brewer because the company's been around for 140 years.' (Protz and Tierney-Jones 2014, 8)

Despite this inclusive beginning, the book takes a critical stance when a craft brewer produces only keg, and no cask ale. Whilst often praising the quality of these keg beers, the attachment to cask seems at times over-bearing. Their position, clearly stated, is that of CAMRA (both are members, and the book is published by CAMRA):

> 'Craft beer', increasingly, is the expression used to distinguish the products of independent brewers from the industrial beers of the global giants. A number of independents have developed a new type of keg beer, often called 'craft keg', that is radically different to the derided keg beers of the 1970s and 80s. CAMRA believes in choice for drinkers and is relaxed about the emergence of modern keg. But the Campaign is rooted in the belief that real ale, naturally conditioned,

unfiltered and served without applied gas pressure, offers the fullest flavours and finest drinking experience for beer lovers. (Protz and Tierney-Jones 2014, 9)

This position was more succinctly, and one might say more viciously, proclaimed by CAMRA chairman Colin Valentine in response to the fallout with BrewDog in 2011. In comments that have been removed from CAMRA's web pages but can be found scattered across the web, Valentine argued that the term "craft beer" was worthless as it had no standard definition, and refused to admit any difference between craft keg and the notorious keg beer of the 1970s that CAMRA originally fought against: "Craft beer changes not a jot between leaving the brewery and getting into the customer's glass and is served using CO_2 and/or nitrogen. It is called KEG BEER" (Beer. Birra. Bier. 2011).

So...Who is Right?

One area in which both traditional beer and contemporary craft beer share a common thread is in the attitudes of their creators. In both cases, brewers see themselves as taking part in a "craft" in the original sense of the term. As Thomas Thurnell-Read has shown, it matters not whether one is brewing cask ale or kegged craft beer, brewers see themselves as personally and bodily involved in the creation of a special product. Each stress similar themes: "the process of acquiring and putting into practice knowledge and skills," and "a more subjective, affective, and impressionistic sense of passion for the craft" (Thurnell-Read 2014, 49). It is in this sense that both types of beer are *hand-crafted*, in opposition to the products of multi-national, industrial brewing companies, which we might say are *manufactured*. Thurnell-Read

finds a second shared focus upon *passion*, that many of the brewers at small enterprises had "placed emphasis on their passion above profit," and that "this passion was worn as a badge of authenticity particularly in relation to the large breweries that were derided as purely economy focused, profit-driven, enterprises" (Thurnell-Read 2014, 50).

These similarities, along with the fact that industrial beer is a common threat to all small brewers, makes it clear that the best thing for the independent beer world would be an Inclusivist spirit, coupled with language that allows people to distinguish between new wave and traditional styles of beer. The problem with the Exclusivist and Traditionalist positions is not their desire to make that distinction—it is the condescension towards the other camp that so often accompanies it. To be sure, the evolution of the term "craft beer" to denote only new wave styles is unfortunate, in that its use seems pejorative towards other types of beer. It is a matter of course that someone who lovingly crafts cask ale will take offence at being excluded from that category.⁵⁾ But the use of language is difficult if not impossible to legislate.

From empirical surveys conducted by the author in 2018 and 2019, it is clear that, at least for the time being, beer drinkers and producers in the UK —as well as other European areas with living beer traditions—Germany, Belgium, and the Czech Republic, among others—are stuck this this distinction. It is in fact the way people speak. In the UK, "cask ale" and "real ale" denote traditional British beer, and "craft beer" denotes new wave beer. Until a better terminology is found *and* widely accepted, this will likely remain the case, despite the strange result that according to such usage, a cask bitter is now considered to be *craft* beer in Germany, Belgium and the Czech Republic (as well as the US and Japan), but not in its home country.

4. Craft Beer, CAMRA, and British Beer Culture Today

In conclusion, we shall touch on a three issues that will likely be of concern in the British beer world in the coming years. These are: 1. The importance of preserving traditional beer in the face of this new competitor, 2. The role and position that CAMRA should take from now on, and 3. The possibility that the new popularity of craft beer might help to further reinvigorate traditional beer.

Preserving Tradition

It has been observed by many that the global popularity of American-style craft beer threatens to erase long-standing local traditions in much the same way that the earlier spread of international pilsner did. Myriam Boivin-Comtois notes:

> For the moment, this phenomenon has been concentrated within European borders, especially in countries where brewing identities are quite fragile. In fact, a multitude of bars specializing in the sale of craft beers are withdrawing local specialties from their menu. Increasingly, they are choosing to offer their customers versions of Indian pale ale (IPA) brewed in the American way (Double IPA, New Zealand IPA, New England IPA, etc.) and beers made with fruit. These are styles of beer that were originally European and have been appropriated and reinterpreted by the United States. (Boivin–Comtois 2019, translated from the French)

> While this trend is more of a consumer-driven movement than the

growth of industrial beer was, it still represents the spread of a hegemonic American culture carried along with economic and cultural globalization. Along with Boivin–Comtois, many worry that "it would be possible for the American hegemony to weaken the expression of regional minority flavors and even condemn them to extinction" (Boivin–Comtois 2019).

A British pub without cask bitter, mild, and stout on tap would be, in the minds of many, including this author, no British pub at all. Something so uniquely British as cask ale, low in alcohol and carbonation and thus highly drinkable, even over long hours and in relatively large quantities, is certainly worth preserving, as long as efforts are made to continue serving it in fine condition and to educate new drinkers as to its character. That said, traditional British beer has always evolved, and it will continue to do so. Diminished interest in sweet, straightforward mild ales might feel unfortunate to the nostalgic drinker, but it also seems inevitable in today's environment. In contrast, however, stout is one style that has clearly been energized by craft brewers, and it is one that can be excellent served from cask. IPA, the most popular style of all craft beers, was originally but one type of bitter. It should take little imagination to adapt many of the traits that make IPAs so popular today (strength, hop aroma and flavor, cleanness of the malt) to existing cask bitters.

While real ale has no doubt surrendered sales to craft beer, it is also a fact that the overwhelming majority of bars, restaurants, and shops selling craft beer continue to offer real ale. In 2019, the only venues that the author found that sold only craft beer were brew pubs or tap rooms dealing solely in the beers of a single brewer who did not produce cask. So even if people visiting craft beer pubs have a preference for keg beer, they are still being exposed to cask ale. Furthermore, many of the leading craft beer venues in London, such as the Craft Beer Co., CASK Pub and Kitchen, Southampton Arms, and Euston / Waterloo Taps, all pride themselves at being adept at the cellaring of cask ale and in being able to produce a perfect pint. There is reason to believe that this is even more true outside of the capital.

Cask ale is thus in little immediate danger of dying out in the UK. One might even say that CAMRA's fears were exaggerated, and that their early efforts to protect it from craft beer have done more harm than good, by alienating craft beer drinkers through their stubbornness and snobbery.

The Role of CAMRA

CAMRA's research in the *Cask Report* itself shows that the problem is not so much the refusal of pubs to carry cask as it is the poor quality of much cask beer, along with it being served too warm (Eley 2018; Eley ed. 2019; Hampson 2018). These are problems that are easily remedied. Climate change has led to hotter summers in Britain, which makes a beer served at 14° less appealing than one served at 7°C or less. And if pubs are remiss, cask ale might be served at even higher temperatures than that, which is enough to discourage the most diehard cask enthusiast. In summer, casks, especially in the south of the country, must be cooled. The problem with infected beer can mostly be solved with the use of a cask breather, which introduces a minimum amount of CO_2 into the cask—enough to keep oxygen out, but not enough to force carbonate the beer. This CAMRA still stubbornly refuses to accept. This is a silly sticking point that many experts believe should be abandoned immediately. All of the most "scientific" trials to date show that cask breathers bring about no negative influence on the enjoyment of cask beer (Dorber 2012). Rejecting them amounts to the kind of attachment to tradition for tradition's sake that makes CAMRA seem so ridiculous to anyone under 30.

CAMRA has made great strides towards diversity and inclusiveness; they need to go a bit further in accepting useful new technology.

Another thing they can do is to fight against the image (rooted to some extent in fact) of real ale drinkers as middle-aged men with beards, big bellies and sandals who like to bore people with their sermons on the superiority of real ale (Philliskirk 2012, 209; Boak and Bailey 2014, 91). By bringing more women, people of color, and young people generally into their festivals and bars, and by adding more variety to cask ale festivals and pubs, they can help shatter this "stuffy" imagine. It should be noted that diversity and inclusivity, aimed particularly towards the LGBTQ community, was a major theme of the 2019 GBBF. This trend must be continued and strengthened. It would also pay to stop portraying craft beer drinkers as fashionable young hipsters who have no real knowledge of beer (Brown 2015; Thomas 2016). While there is a great deal of fashion included in the world of craft beer, as drinkers age and move on in life they are less likely to stick to the fashions of today than they are to continue to drink beer. CAMRA should do its best not to alienate them now.

Reinvigorating Tradition

Lastly, it can be argued that, if handled correctly, the rise of craft beer might help to preserve traditional styles more than it will threaten them. In this respect, we might point to the sudden rise in popularity of old-style Bavarian and Bohemian lagers among craft beer enthusiasts and brewers in the US. After a 20-year orgy of more hops, more additives, and more alcohol, many beer drinkers now want something that doesn't shock their taste buds into paralysis or leave them drunk after two pints. The traditional beers of Europe, including British bitter and mild, generally fill this need. Another area giving a boost to traditional beer is international tourism. As craft beer enthusiasts and brewers from around the world travel to traditional European brewing locales, they more often prefer to seek out the best examples of traditional, local styles than they wish to drink local craft beer ("I can drink IPAs at *home...*"). Several brewers of traditional Franconian Kellerbier in Germany have said as much to the author: "At first I felt frustrated that these inexperienced young brewers were calling their beer "craft" but not ours. But when the famous craft brewers from the US visit, they come to drink at my brewery, not theirs." This overseas interest in traditional beer styles has also led to growth in the export of traditional beer. Indeed, British bitter is more likely to be seen on tap or in bottle in the US, Japan, or Germany than is British craft beer.

Most international writers on beer promote both traditional as well as new wave beer, and interest in the traditional styles of distant lands is far from waning. Some writers go so far as to attempt to reproduce the roots of pre-industrial local brewing traditions such as farmhouse beers. There have been at least three book-length manuscripts on the topic published in the last two years (Thibault 2019; Laitinen 2019; Garshol 2020). These are garnering the attention of drinkers as well as brewers the world over, and have led to many new world craft brewers attempting to replicate or interpret these pre-modern recipes. While interest in innovation is strong, so is interest in tradition, and in letting tradition spur innovation.

In conclusion, then, we can say that traditional British beer culture is definitely something worth preserving, and that, notwithstanding a handful of loudmouth rebels, there is quite a broad and international consensus on this point. We must also keep in mind, however, that throughout that tradition,

change and evolution have been constant, so any attempt to stick too stubbornly to one version of tradition would not only betray the facts we glean from history, it might also run the risk of harming the tradition one is trying to save. To this end, CAMRA should continue to promote and protect cask ale, but it should do so in a more progressive, inclusive, and open-minded way. There is good evidence that they are turning in that direction already. Lastly, we might also say to the lovers of new wave craft beers that they should do a bit more research into the backgrounds of their favorite drinks. This would surely lead them to a greater respect for traditional beer styles and serving methods.

Notes

- 1) The difference in meaning between "beer" and "ale" has evolved historically. Today, "ale" signifies a beer made with top-fermenting yeast. Opposed to this is "lager" which is made with bottom-fermenting yeast. In this essay, "ale" will be used exclusively to specify top-fermented beer, whereas "beer" while be used inclusively, signifying both ale and lager.
- Research on this essay was financially supported by the Kansai University Fund for Domestic and Overseas Research, 2019.
- The fullest description I have yet found of the early activities of CAMRA is in Boak and Bailey 2014.
- 4) We might question just how innovative packaging can make a product craft—the innovative packaging and advertising of industrial breweries is one of the major points criticized by craft beer fans and brewers alike.
- 5) It is interesting to note that many small, traditional brewers in Germany expressed a similar indignation at having new wave beer (often seen to be of inferior quality) labeled "craft" while their beers were excluded from the category. The term is doubly unfortunate in that it makes no immediate reference to size or independence: it is also possible for large-scale industrial brewers who brew new wave beer styles to claim they are making craft beer.

Bibliography

Tom Acitelli. 2013. The Audacity of Hops. Chicago: Chicago Review Press.

- Beer, Birra, Bier, 2011. "Colin Valentine on Beer Bloggers." May 29, 2011. http://www.beerbirrabier.com/2011/05/colin-valentine-on-beer-bloggers.html. Accessed September 6, 2020.
- Jessica Boak and Ray Bailey. 2014. Brew Britannia: The Strange Rebirth of British Beer. London: Aurum.
- Myriam Boivin Comtois. 2018. "Bieres et mondialisation: Lorsque la micro deviant macro," in *Revue No. 77.* https://www.ababord.org/Bieres-et-mondialisation-Lorsque-la-microdevient-macro. Accessed July 31, 2020.
- Brewdog Press Hub. 2011. "CAMRA Cancels BrewDog's Bar at the Great British Beer Festival." July 19, 2011. https://presshub.brewdog.com/presshub/camra-cancelsbrewdogs-bar-at-the-great-british-beer-festival. Accessed September 6, 2020.
- BrewDog. 2020. "BrewDog History: Our Beer Journey so Far." https://www.brewdog. com/uk/community/culture/our-history. Accessed September 2, 2020.
- Brewers Association. 2020. "Craft Brewer Definition." https://www.brewersassociation. org/statistics-and-data/craft-brewer-definition/. Accessed September 2, 2020.
- Pete Brown. 2015. "Trouble Brewing: How Craft Beer Fomented a Battle for the Soul of Booze," in *The Guardian*, March 21, 2015.
- Campaign for Real Ale. 2020. "What is Real Ale?" on CAMRA Official Website. https://camra.org.uk/learn-discover/the-basics/what-is-real-ale/. Accessed August 19, 2020.
- Martyn Cornell. 2003. Beer: The Story of the Pint, The History of Britain's Most Popular Drink. London: Headline.
- —. 2010. Amber Gold & Black: The History of Britain's Great Beers. Stroud: The History Press.
- -----. 2012. "Endangered Beers," on Zythophile, May 22, 2012.

- Matt Dorber. 2012. "Real Ale," in Garrett Oliver (ed.) *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, pp. 688-9.
- Matt Eley. 2018. "Chilling Facts behind Cask Beer's Falling Sales," in *What's Brewing*, November 2018. P. 12.
- —, ed. 2019. The Cask Report. https://mk0caskmarqueqadnnvg.kinstacdn.com/wpcontent/uploads/2019/09/Cask-Report-2019-20.pdf. Accessed July 31, 2020.
- Lars Marius Garshol. 2020. Historical Brewing Techniques: The Lost Art of Farmhouse

http://zythophile.co.uk/2012/05/22/endangered-beers/. Accessed July 31, 2020.

Brewing. Boulder: Brewers Publications.

- Robin Goldsmith. 2019. "Great British Beer Festival 2019," on Ryebeck website. https://www. ryebeckltd.com/great-british-beer-festival-2019/. Accessed September 6, 2020.
- Hacker Young. 2020. "Stall in Number of UK Breweries as Craft Beer Boom Slows Down," May 4, 2020. https://www.uhy-uk.com/news-events/news/stall-in-number-of-ukbreweries-as-craft-beer-boom-slows-down/. Accessed September 2, 2020.
- Tim Hampson. 2013. World Beer: Outstanding Classic and Craft Beer from the Greatest Breweries. London: Dorling Kindersley.
- —. 2018. "Cask Beer is Just not Cool enough for Young Drinkers," in What's Brewing, November 2018, p. 1.
- Peter Haydon. 2001. Beer and Britannia: An Inebriated History of Britain. Stroud: Sutton.
- Steve Hindy. 2014. The Craft Beer Revolution. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Sonya Hook. 2019. "GBBF Opens up to Craft Kegs for First Time," in Drinks Retailing News, July 15, 2019.
- Brian Hunt. 2012. "Beer Engine," in Garrett Oliver (ed.) *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, p. 109.
- Nick R. Jones. 2012. "Ale," in Garrett Oliver (ed.) The Oxford Companion to Beer, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, pp. 26-8.
- Mika Laitinen. 2019. Viking Age Brew: The Craft of Brewing Sahti Farmhouse Ale. Chicago: Chicago Review.
- Mark Meli. 2012. "Beer Styles: English Bitter," in Japan Beer Times no. 10, Spring 2012.
- Tony Naylor. 2017. "Why the Pub isn't the Only Place Drinkers Should Buy Craft Beers," in *Guardian*, July 12, 2017.
- Barrie Pepper. 2012. "Cask Conditioning," in Garrett Oliver (ed.) The Oxford Companion to Beer, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, pp. 228–9.
- Michelle Perrett. 2011. "CAMRA Defends Stance on BrewDog," in *Morning Advertiser*, July 27, 2011.
- George Philliskirk. 2012. "Campaign for Real Ale (CAMRA)," in Garrett Oliver (ed.) *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, pp. 208–10.
- Roger Protz. 2019. "New Look CAMRA out to Broaden Base," on Protz on Beer, March 31, 2019. https://protzonbeer.co.uk/features/2019/03/31/new-look-camra-out-to-broadenbase. Accessed July 31, 2020.
- Roger Protz and Adrian Tierney-Jones. 2014. Britain's Beer Revolution. Behind the Scenes with the People, Breweries, and Beers Inspiring a Nation. St. Albans: CAMRA.
- Wolfgang Schivelbusch. 1992. Tastes of Paradise: A Social History of Spices, Stimulants, and

Intoxicants. New York: Vintage.

- SIBA. "Assured Independent Brewer Campaign." http://www.indiecraftbrewers.co.uk/index. asp. Accessed September 5, 2020.
- Stagweb. 2019. "14 Best London Craft Breweries." April 24, 2019. https://www.stagweb.co. uk/blog/2019/04/14-london-craft-breweries/. Accessed September 5, 2020.

Martin Thibault. 2019. Le goût de la bière fermière. Montreal: Druide.

- Hugh Thomas. 2016. "Craft Beer: Is it Closing Time for the Campaign for Real Ale?" in *The Guardian*, April 19, 2016.
- Thomas Thurnell-Read. 2014. "Craft, Tangibility and Affect at Work in the Microbrewery," in *Emotion, Space and Society No. 13*, pp. 46-54.